



OHIO DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION

DISTRICT 12
5500 TRANSPORTATION BLVD. • GARFIELD HGTS., OH 44125 • 216-581-2100

Environmental Document for **CUY Hilliard Road Bridge PID 109594**

Environmental Document Level: D1

Approved: 9/15/2023

Prepared By: Susan Daniels

Lawhon & Associates, Inc.

Phone: 614-481-8600

E-mail: sdaniels@lawhon-assoc.com

District Contact: Mark Carpenter

Phone: 216-584-2089

E-mail: Mark.Carpenter@dot.ohio.gov

The environmental review, consultation, and other actions required by applicable Federal environmental laws for this project are being, or have been, carried out by ODOT pursuant to 23 U.S.C. 327 and a Memorandum of Understanding dated December 14, 2020, and executed by FHWA and ODOT.

Table of Contents

Project Type.....	3
General Project Information.....	4
Purpose & Need.....	8
Alternatives.....	10
Air.....	12
Noise.....	14
ESA.....	15
Cultural Resources.....	16
Ecological.....	19
Other Resources.....	24
Section 4(f).....	26
Section 6(f).....	28
Community Impacts.....	30
Environmental Justice.....	32
Public Involvement.....	33
Permits.....	35
Environmental Commitments.....	37
Preparers and Approvals.....	41
Appendix.....	45



Environmental Document Level: D1
PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge
Approved: 9/15/2023

Project Type

Please check all of the following actions that apply (Must check at least one):

- (13) Actions described in 23 CFR 771.117 (c)(26), (c)(27), and (c)(28) that do not meet the constraints listed in 23 CFR 771.117(e).
- (a) Project types that exceed thresholds in Appendix A
- (b) Project types that exceed thresholds in Appendix B



Environmental Document Level: D1

PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge

Approved: 9/15/2023

General Project Information

Project, Cost Schedule and Work Limits

Environmental Document Level: D1
PID: 109594
Project Name: CUY Hilliard Road Bridge
Project Sponsor: CUYAHOGA COUNTY ENGINEER
ODOT District: 12
Funding Source: Federal
The next phase of the proposed project is listed on the STIP Yes

Ellis STIP Details

Phase	Current STIP Reference
ENV	
CO	109594: 24-27 STIP
DD	

An Interchange Modification/Justification/Operations Study (IMS/IJS/IOS) was completed No

Project Description:

The Hilliard Road Bridge connects the communities of Lakewood and Rocky River in Cuyahoga County. Hilliard Road itself is part of an established County Road system (CR-69) that represents a network of primary roads that traverse throughout the County. The bridge is in poor physical condition, with concrete debris falling from the structure. The purpose and need of this undertaking is to provide a structurally sound and safe bridge crossing to accommodate both vehicular and pedestrian traffic on and below the bridge, as well as park visitors and river users under the bridge.

Limits of Proposed Work: Hilliard Road over the Rocky River
Start (SLM): 8.417
End (SLM): 8.670
Total Work Length (Miles): 0.217

No roadway data for PIDs associated with this CE Form

Sufficiency Rating: 055.4
General Rating: 4
Date Built: 07/01/1925
Bridge Location: 910 FT W OF ROCKY RVR DR



40. Bridge Type: 111N

Design Criteria For Bridges

SFN: 1830147

Sufficiency Rating: 055.4

General Rating: 4

Date Built: 07/01/1925

Bridge Location: 910 FT W OF ROCKY RVR DR

	Existing:	Proposed:
Bridge Type:	111N	411
Bridge Length (ft):	893	869
Number of Main Spans:	10	5
Max Span Length (ft):	220	525
Load Restrictions (TON):	70	N/A
Curb to Curb Width (ft):	56	26
Shoulder Width(ft):	0	0
Under Clearance (ft):	100	100

Bridge Type Description:

The replacement bridge is a 5-span structure comprised of a steel deck arch main span over the valley floor with steel girder approach spans on the valley slopes. The bridge will be designed in accordance with the current AASHTO LRFD Bridge Design Code for HL93 live load and as such, will not need to be posted for any legal loads. See General\Project Information\Schematic Plan-updated.pdf.

Load Restrictions Description: Proposed bridge is loading HL-93.

Will the structure be rehabilitated or replaced as part of the project? Yes

If this bridge is a historic bridge, what type is it? Open Spandrel Arch/Reinforced Concrete

Remarks:

On June 10, 2021, the Ohio State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) concurred the proposed removal of the Hilliard Road Bridge (SFN 1830147), eligible for inclusion in the NRHP, constitutes an adverse effect.

41. Bridge Length (ft): 893

42. Number of Main Spans: 10

43. Max Span Length (ft): 220

44. Load Restrictions (TON): 70

45. Curb to Curb Width (ft): 56



Maintenance of Traffic During Construction

A roadway, bridge or ramp closure is required	Yes
A temporary bridge or roadway is proposed	No
A detour is required for the proposed project	Yes
Access for local through traffic will be provided with appropriate signage	No
Provisions for through-traffic dependent businesses will be incorporated into project design	No
Provisions to accommodate any local special events or festivals will be incorporated into project design	No
The proposed MOT substantially impacts sensitive environmental resources	No
Substantial controversy is associated with the proposed MOT	No
Coordination has been initiated and/or completed with local emergency services, schools, public institutions/facilities, etc.	Yes

Remarks:

Traffic on Hilliard Road will be detoured for approximately two years during construction. The posted detour will be: Wooster Drive, Detroit Avenue, Riverside Drive, Madison Avenue, and McKinley Avenue. Valley View Parkway under the bridge will also be detoured for short periods of up to a week at a time as needed via: Rockcliff Drive, Wooster Drive, and Detroit Avenue.

The detour was included in public involvement presentations. Comments regarding the detour were received during public involvement in 2021. The primary concerns were the length of the detour (described as 2-3 years at that time) and making sure that alternative routes could accommodate trucks. CCDPW indicated that construction duration (and therefore detour duration) was a factor in evaluating alternatives and that the proposed detour route will be able to accommodate the type of truck traffic that currently uses Hilliard Road.

Are there any Environmental Commitments?	No
---	----

Right of Way and Utility Involvement

The project requires Permanent Right-of-Way	Yes
The project requires Permanent Easement(s)	Yes
The project requires Temporary Right-of-Way	Yes
Number of parcels impacted by Permanent Right-of-Way:	3
Number of parcels impacted by Temporary Right-of-Way:	11
Approximate acreage of Permanent Right-of-Way needed:	0.187
Approximate acreage of Temporary Right-of-Way needed:	4.058
Electrical lines, gas lines, water lines, sewer lines, phone lines or other utilities exist in the project area	Yes
Large scale transmission facilities are located within the project area	No



Environmental Document Level: D1

PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge

Approved: 9/15/2023

Private utility easements are located within the project area

No

Coordination with identified utilities has been initiated and/or completed

Yes

Remarks:

Right-of-Way: During records research for the project, it was determined that the County was granted permission to build the Hilliard Rd Bridge via an agreement between the Cleveland Metropark Board and Cuyahoga County Commissioners. This agreement did not convey any actual property rights but memorialized a cooperative agreement that allowed the County to build the bridge. Therefore, both permanent and temporary easements will be needed to construct the new bridge. An aerial easement for the structure with permanent easements around the piers are anticipated. A temporary easement of up to 100-ft south of the existing right-of-way will be needed to allow for construction, access and staging under the bridge. See Section 4(f) and Section 6(f) sections for details.

Temporary easements may also be required for sidewalk reconstruction at the west end of the bridge. At the east end of the bridge, temporary easements are anticipated for the corners of the intersection at Riverside Drive. Design is in progress and preliminary right-of-way plans are currently in development and have been used for calculation of approximate quantities.

Utilities located within the project construction limits include:

- AT&T - Ohio Distribution
- City of Columbus - DOS
- City of Columbus - Traffic
- City of Columbus - Water
- City of Columbus - Power (lighting)
- City of Columbus - Power (Distribution)
- Century Link
- Wide Open West (WOW)
- Verizon Business
- Columbia Gas Transmission
- Crown Castle Fiber
- Zayo Group
- Columbia Gas of Ohio
- AEP Ohio - Transmission
- City of Bexley
- AEP Ohio - Distribution
- Charter Communications (Spectrum)

The project team has initiated coordination with all utilities to request records of the location of underground utilities early in the design process. Most recent coordination included Stage 1 Design Plans which were submitted to the listed utilities.

- **Coordination documents can be found in the Project File under General/Right-of-Way and Utility Involvement**



Purpose & Need

Purpose & Need

Project History:

Constructed in 1925, the Hilliard Road Bridge 08.57 (SFN 1830147) is a 893-foot long, four-lane bridge over the Rocky River, Valley Parkway, and a Cleveland Metroparks' all-purpose trail. The bridge is a multiple span open-spandrel reinforced concrete arch structure that is considered a historic structure and is listed on the ODOT historic bridge inventory (listed on 9/27/2010).

The Hilliard Road Bridge is one of four bridges crossing the Rocky River to connect the cities of Rocky River and Lakewood in Cuyahoga County, Ohio. Two of the other four bridge crossings between the two communities are located about a mile north of the Hilliard Road Bridge. The other bridge crossing in the vicinity of the Hilliard Road Bridge, Interstate 90, is a controlled-access interstate highway which leaves Hilliard Road Bridge as the only direct connection serving local traffic between the southern portions of Rocky River and Lakewood.

The bridge was originally designed to carry two lanes of traffic and a trolley line. A major rehabilitation in 1983 replaced the bridge deck and removed the trolley line. The bridge has undergone three minor rehabilitations since the major rehabilitation in 1983. In 1994, a 36" diameter waterline and an access catwalk were installed along the length of the bridge in the middle bay of the structure. In 1999, the bituminous overlay on the roadway added during the 1983 rehabilitation was replaced with a microsilica overlay. In 2013, the sidewalks on the structure underwent a partial depth replacement. The configuration of the deck consists of a 56'-0" curb-to-curb roadway with 9'-6" wide sidewalks on both sides. The structure is oriented in the east-west direction and runs parallel to Interstate 90 to the north.

Purpose Statement:

The purpose of the project is to address the substandard conditions of the Hilliard Road Bridge, provide and maintain a functional bridge passage of Hilliard Road to connect the Cities of Lakewood and Rocky River, and maintain safety for users of Valley Parkway and the Metroparks' all-purpose trail below the bridge.

Need Element(s):

The primary need for the project is to improve safety for motorists and pedestrians on and below the bridge. This need is driven by the poor physical condition of the bridge. The bridge currently exhibits widespread deterioration, including concrete delamination and spalling with exposed rebar, and is posted for weight reductions. As noted in the Feasibility Study, further deterioration of the bridge could lead to eventual closure. Drainage issues are also noted throughout the bridge.

As recorded in the 2013 In-depth Physical Condition Report, the bridge is in poor condition [4-NBIS] overall. Several deficiencies throughout the structure contribute to this rating, including the poor condition of the deck [4-NBIS], poor condition of the floor [4-NBIS], poor condition of the wearing surface [4-NBIS], poor condition of the superstructure [4-NBIS], poor condition of the arch columns and arches [4-NBIS], and poor drainage [4-NBIS]. Following the 2013 inspection, the Metroparks all-purpose trail below the bridge was diverted and debris netting was installed in Span 3 to protect trail users from concrete falling off the structure. A supplemental inspection of the bridge was performed in June 2018. The inspection found that the bridge continues to be in poor condition [4-NBIS] overall and the spall and delamination occurrences have increased in quantity and magnitude.

Goals and Objectives:



Environmental Document Level: D1

PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge

Approved: 9/15/2023

Include design elements that simulate historic features of the existing bridge and provide an aesthetically pleasing view from the park below.

Summary Statement:

The purpose of the project is to address the substandard conditions of the Hilliard Road Bridge and maintain a safe connection between the cities of Lakewood and Rocky River while also maintaining safety for users of the park and trail below the bridge. The project is needed due to substandard bridge conditions. The bridge currently exhibits widespread deterioration, including concrete delamination and spalling with exposed rebar. According to inspections performed in 2013 and 2018, the bridge is in overall poor condition [4-NBIS] due to the poor condition of the deck [4-NBIS], floor [4-NBIS], wearing surface [4-NBIS], superstructure [4-NBIS], arch columns and arches [4-NBIS], and drainage [4-NBIS]. Between the 2013 and 2018 inspections, the spall and delamination occurrences increased in quantity and magnitude.

Logical Termini and Independent Utility:

The logical termini are the limits of the bridge structure and its immediate approaches. This project is a single and complete project that is independent of any other transportation improvements in the area.



Alternatives

Alternatives

Discuss No Build Alternative:

The no Build Alternative involves no improvements other than routine maintenance and does not satisfy the Purpose and Need of the project. It would not address the substandard conditions of the existing bridge nor provide safety from falling debris for park, trail, and river users below the bridge.

Was a Feasibility Study completed? Yes

Date Feasibility Study was approved: 08/05/2020

Was an Alternative Evaluation Report (AER) completed? Yes

Date AER was approved: 08/03/2021

Alternatives Considered

Name	Description	Reason Dismissed	Included in the AER	Preferred Alternative
No Build	No improvements other than routine maintenance	Does not meet Purpose and Need	No	No
Rehabilitation	Rehabilitate the existing structure with the intent to maintain the historic integrity of the bridge.	The uncertainty of the condition and amount of deterioration of the arches and piers discovered during construction may potentially add an undetermined amount of cost and time to the project.	No	No
Removal of the existing bridge and replacement on the existing alignment	Require removal of the historic bridge to build a new bridge in its place, maintaining the existing footprint of the road.	Selected as the Preferred Alternative	Yes	Yes
Replacement Structure on New Alignment and retaining Existing Bridge	The existing bridge would remain in place and a new bridge would be build next to it on a new alignment.	Does not meet Purpose and Need	No	No



Environmental Document Level: D1

PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge

Approved: 9/15/2023

Discuss Reasons Alternative Identified as Preferred was selected:

Alternative 3 meets the Purpose and Need by addressing the poor bridge condition and eliminating debris falling to the river, park, trail, and roadway below. It would allow the trail to be moved back to its original location within the park. It would not impact any residences. It also has the longest life span, estimated to be 75 years and the most predictable construction cost out of any of the Build alternatives.

Note: Subsequent to the Feasibility Study, a supplemental investigation was undertaken to assess the feasibility of re-using the existing piers. The results of that effort were presented in a deliverable that recommended the existing piers not be reused (Hilliard Road Bridge Existing Substructure Evaluation Report dated June 27, 2022). See project file \Purpose and Need\Existing and Future Conditions.



Air

Mobile Source Air Toxics (MSATs)

Sensitive Areas are located within approximately 500' of the proposed project area Yes

The proposed project is listed as a C1 in ODOT's CE Guidance and/or falls under 40 CFR 93.126 Yes

Remarks:

There is one multifamily structure and several residential structures within 500' of the proposed project area. No other Sensitive Areas are located within 500' of the proposed project. This project does not add capacity, a new interchange, or a new road on new alignment. This project will not result in any meaningful changes in traffic volume, vehicle mix, location of the existing facility, or any other factor that would cause an increase in emissions impacts relative to the no-build alternative. The project is exempt under 40 CFR 93.126 - Exempt projects, Safety: Widening narrow pavements or reconstructing bridges (no additional travel lanes).

Particulate Matter 2.5 (PM2.5)

The proposed project is in an air quality non-attainment or maintenance area Yes

The proposed project falls under 40 CFR 93.126 Yes

Remarks:

The project is in Cuyahoga County which is a PM2.5 maintenance or non-attainment area. However, this project is exempt from PM2.5 analysis per 40 CFR 93.126; widening narrow pavements or reconstructing bridges.

Carbon (CO)

The State of Ohio is in attainment for CO at this time and no coordination or analysis is required

Ozone

The proposed project is in an Ozone non-attainment or maintenance area Yes

The proposed project is listed on the TIP Yes

Remarks:

Cuyahoga County is in an ozone maintenance or non-attainment area. However, because the project is in the STIP, ozone is addressed.

Greenhouse Gas

A Quantitative Greenhouse Gas (GHG) Analysis is required No

Remarks:



Environmental Document Level: D1
PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge
Approved: 9/15/2023

A quantitative Greenhouse Gas (GHG) Analysis is not required.

Environmental Commitments

Are there any environmental commitments? No



Environmental Document Level: D1

PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge

Approved: 9/15/2023

Noise

Noise

Noise Sensitive Areas located within approximately 500' of the proposed project area Yes

Noise Analysis conducted No

The proposed project is a Type I project No

The proposed project is a Type II project No

Remarks:

No noise analysis is required because the project is not moving travel lanes significantly closer (50%) to noise sensitive areas and/or adding capacity.

Environmental Commitments

Are there any environmental commitments? No



Environmental Document Level: D1

PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge

Approved: 9/15/2023

ESA

ESA

Does the project require any Permanent ROW or Easement?: Yes

ESA Screening Report was completed by District Staff No

Date of ESA Screening IOC from OES: 10/01/2020

Do any sites require a Phase 1 ESA, Phase 2 ESA, or plan note according to the IOC from OES? No

Remarks:

Lawhon & Associates, Inc. conducted Regulated Materials Review for the project in September 2020 which was conducted in accordance with the Ohio Department of Transportation Office of Environmental Services (ODOT-OES) Regulated Materials Review Manual (2018). As a result of this review, no sites warranted further site assessment or special material management. ODOT-OES issued an email on October 1, 2020 stating agreement.

Due to Section 6(f) impacts on the Rocky River Reservation as a part of the project, the Cleveland Metroparks intends to purchase property located in Garfield Heights. Lawhon & Associates, Inc. conducted Regulated Materials Review on these properties in January 2022 which was conducted in accordance with the Ohio Department of Transportation Office of Environmental Services (ODOT-OES) Regulated Materials Review Manual (2018). As a result of this review, no sites warranted further site assessment or special material management. ODOT-OES issued an email on January 14, 2022 stating agreement.

Lawhon & Associates, Inc. conducted an Asbestos Inspection of the Hilliard Road Bridge in July 2018. The inspection did not identify any Asbestos Containing Materials defined by U.S. EPA/NESHAP regulations.

According to the IOC from OES does the project require any Environmental Commitments (plan notes and/or other coordination)? Yes



Cultural Resources

Cultural Properties Present

Please describe all of the efforts made to identify Historic Properties (including lit review, field investigation, etc.):

Lawhon & Associates, Inc. prepared the Section 106 Scoping Request on August 13, 2020. The request for review provided a records check which included a review of electronic data from the Ohio State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) to identify properties within the project area listed on or eligible for the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP), Ohio Archaeological Inventory (OAI) sites, Ohio Historic Inventory (OHI) buildings and structures. No OHI sites were identified within the project area. One OAI (33CU0013) the Hilliard Site was identified within the project area. The site is an Open Unknown Prehistoric Camp site positioned on the crest of the ridge adjacent to the eastern end of the study Area. The bridge is eligible for listing on the NRHP. No other NRHP-qualified resources are located in the APE. No archaeological resources are known in the APE and impacts to significant archaeological sites are unlikely. No further archaeological investigations are recommended.

It was learned the project will require a 6(f) replacement property to offset or mitigate construction impacts to 3.56 acres of parkland/recreational area associated with the bridge site. Equivalent replacement property (44.8 acres) has been located in the Garfield Heights area, Cuyahoga County, Ohio to offset the take. Based on this new information, the project's area of potential affects (APE) has been expanded to include this replacement site. Preliminary cultural resources investigations were initiated to determine if additional historic properties might be impacted by the expanded project scope. On December 10, 2021, a literature search was conducted by ODOT OES to determine if previously recorded cultural resources would be affected by the acquisition of additional parkland in Garfield Heights, Ohio. The literature search was conducted using data from the Ohio History Connection/Ohio Historic Preservation Office. The investigation focused on an area of open, wooded land highlighted in green on SHPO mapping (see the 6F Replacement Property Map under Cultural Resources Project Information in the CUY-Hilliard Road Bridge Project File). The mapping documents the absence of known or inventoried history/architecture in the project area. Two archaeological sites (33CU482 and 33CU483) are reported on the land to be acquired for mitigation purposes. The entire survey tract is shown to have been previously surveyed for archaeological resources. So, the existence for additional significant archaeological sites in the area is unlikely. In conclusion, no Historic Properties (resources listed or eligible for the NRHP) or National Historic Landmarks are reported in the 44.8 acre land replacement property.

Is there an eligible or listed NRHP Historic Property in the Area of Potential Effects Pursuant to 36 CFR part 800? Yes

OES Approval/OSHPO Concurrence Date:

03/21/2022

Remarks:

On June 10, 2021, the Ohio State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) concurred the proposed removal of the Hilliard Road Bridge (SFN 1830147), eligible for inclusion in the NRHP, constitutes an adverse effect.

Subsequent to the June 10, 2021 adverse effect determination, ODOT-OES reviewed a Section 6(f) replacement property to offset or mitigate impacts to 3.56 acres of parkland/recreational area associated with the bridge site. Equivalent replacement property (44.8 acres) was located in the Garfield Heights area, Cuyahoga County, Ohio to offset the take. Based on this new information, the area of potential affects was expanded to include the replacement site. Preliminary cultural resources investigations were initiated to determine if additional historic properties might be impacted by the expanded project scope. On December 10, 2021 in accordance with the Section 106 Programmatic Agreement (Agreement No. 19319) executed November 8, 2017 and amended July 11, 2019, ODOT-OES concluded no cultural resources listed in or eligible for listing in the NRHP are known in the mitigation area and no further archaeological investigations are warranted.

ODOT-OES reviewed the proposed design for the preferred alternative. Excluding the Hilliard Road Bridge, no additional Historic Properties (resources listed or eligible for the NRHP) will be affected by the undertaking.



Please check all NRHP Eligible and/or Listed resources:

Bridge

What is the Section 106 effect determination in the OES Transmittal? Adverse Effect

Does this project have an Adverse Effect on Archaeological resources? No

Does this project have an Adverse Effect on History/Architecture resources? Yes

Archaeological Resource Adverse Effect

History/Architecture Adverse Effect

Date OSHPO Concurred with Adverse Effect determination: 06/10/2021

Date Documentation for Consultation was sent

ACHP: 06/29/2021

OSHPO: 06/02/2021

Is FHWA consultation required? No

Did you contact any other Consulting Parties? Yes

Consulting Parties

Additional Party Name	Documentation Date:
Jennifer Dieringer	05/03/2019
Greg Palumbo	05/03/2019
Christopher Blue	02/16/2021
Sara Buddner	02/16/2021
Frederick Weinmann	02/23/2021
Paul Accordino	06/02/2021
Ann Marie Rodgers	06/02/2021
Joanne Douglas	06/02/2021
Laura Rodriguez-Carbone	06/02/2021
Peter Ketter	06/02/2021

Date of Advisory Council on Historic Preservation response: 07/05/2021

Is Advisory Council on Historic Preservation participating? No

Date MOA was executed: 04/25/2023

Tribal Consultation

Tribal Consultation Summary/Remarks:

The Delaware Nation and the Delaware Tribe of Oklahoma were notified three times during project development. They were



Environmental Document Level: D1
PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge
Approved: 9/15/2023

Environmental Commitments

Are there any Environmental Commitments? Yes



Ecological

Has an ESR been completed? Yes

Date ESR was completed: 08/28/2020

Has an Approved and/or Preliminary Jurisdictional Determination been made by the USACE? No

Are Wetlands Present? Yes

Are Any Wetlands impacted? Yes

Has a Wetland Delineation been made? Yes

Identified Wetlands

Wetland ID	ORAM Category	Type	Est Total Size (Acres)	Est Impact (Acres)
Wetland A-1	2	Non-Isolated	.032	.003
Wetland A-2	2	Non-Isolated	.083	.083
Wetland A-3	2	Non-Isolated	.008	.008
Wetland B-1	2	Non-Isolated	.007	.007
Wetland B-2	2	Non-Isolated	.045	.045
Wetland B-3	2	Non-Isolated	.006	.006
Wetland B-4	2	Non-Isolated	.004	.004
Wetland C	1	Non-Isolated	.001	.001

Est. Total Size (Acres) of for Project: 0.186

Est. Total Impacted (Acres) of for Project: 0.157

Total Acres of Non-Isolated Wetlands impacted: 0.157

Total Acres of Isolated Wetlands impacted: 0

Remarks:

A Level 1 Ecological Survey Report (ESR) dated August 28, 2020, was completed by Lawhon and Associates. Field investigations were conducted on July 29, 2020 by Lawhon and Associates ecological staff. Based on the results of the ESR, eight (8) non-isolated wetlands totaling 0.186 acres were identified within the project study area. The estimated wetland impact totals 0.157 acres.

The ESR can be found in the Project File under Ecological/Reports

Streams & Rivers

Present:

Impacted:



Environmental Document Level: D1

PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge

Approved: 9/15/2023

Streams and Rivers:	Yes	Yes
National Scenic River:	No	
State Scenic River:	No	
Sec 9:	No	
Sec 10:	No	

Impacted Streams and Rivers

Stream Name	Total Linear feet Impacted	QHEI	Aquatic Life Use Designation
Rocky River	306	70.5	Warm Water Habitat (WWH)

Total Linear feet Impacted:

306

Remarks:

Based on the results of the ESR, one stream (Rocky River) was identified within the proposed project area. Rocky River flows downstream from the project area for approximately 2.3 miles before it connects to Lake Erie. Impacts to Rocky River include demolition of the existing bridge and construction of a new bridge, impacting a total length of 306 feet of Rocky River. The details for demolition and the construction of the new bridge have yet to be determined.

Other Surface Waters

	Present:	Impacted:
Reservoirs:	No	
Lakes:	No	
Ponds:	No	
Storm Water Management Facility:	No	
Jurisdictional Ditch:	No	
Other (If selected please explain in remarks):	No	

Remarks:

Based on the results of the ESR, no other surface waters were identified within the project study area.

Terrestrial Habitat

	Present:	Impacted:
Terrestrial Habitat:	Yes	Yes
Unique or high Quality:	No	

Remarks:



Environmental Document Level: D1

PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge

Approved: 9/15/2023

Based on the results of the Level 1 ESR, it was determined the proposed project area is overwhelmingly dominated by 3.7145 acres of developed medium density areas (mixture of constructed materials and vegetation) consisting of parking areas, paved paths, roadway, and developed open space. The project area also consists of 1.2721 acres of open water. Some other areas of vegetative communities are present including 1.7545 acres of upland forest, 0.5526 acres of floodplain forest, 0.0619 acres of forested swamp, and 0.0955 acres of herbaceous riverine community. None of the communities were determined to be unique, rare, or high quality.

Threatened or Endangered Species

	Present:	Impacted:
Within the known range of a Federal Species?	Yes	Yes
Federal Species/habitat found within the project area?	Yes	Yes
Within the known range of a State Species?	Yes	Yes
State Species/habitat found within the project area?	Yes	Yes

Remarks:

The proposed project area is located within the known ranges of the following Federally listed species:

Indiana Bat (*Myotis sodalis*) and Northern Long-eared Bat (*Myotis septentrionalis*) - There are 2.3690 acres of suitable wooded habitat (SWH) located within the project area, 2.2596 acres of which is located within 100 feet from the edge of pavement, 0.0865 acre of which is located outside of 100 feet from pavement and more than 50 feet away from a stream, and 0.0229 acre of which is located outside of 100 feet from pavement and within 50 feet of a stream. Construction limits were not available at the time of the ESR submission. Using the study area limits as a worst-case scenario for the calculation of impacts, 2.3690 acres of suitable wooded habitat could be impacted. No evidence of bat habitation was observed underneath the I-90 bridge or the Hilliard Road bridge. The project is not located in a USFWS bat buffer zone. The Ohio Natural Heritage Database review did not reveal any Indiana bat capture records or hibernacula within a one-mile radius of the project site. All tree removal will occur between October 1 and March 31. This project meets CC1 and may affect but is not likely to adversely affect these species.

Bald Eagle (*Haliaeetus leucocephalus*) - Based on the Natural Heritage Database, no known nest is located within 0.5 mile of the project. No nests were found within 660 feet nor visible from the project area during the July 29, 2020 field visit. The Rocky River offers suitable foraging habitat to bald eagles within the project area. The riparian corridor buffering the river within the study area would not be considered a mature forest. The corridor looked to be a recovering second growth forest.

Piping Plover (*Charadrius melodus*) - Potential habitat does not exist within the study area, as the study area does not contain sandy beaches devoid of vegetation or mudflats.

Rufa Red Knot (*Calidris canutus rufa*) - The Rufa red knot migrates through Ohio in the spring and fall, but is not known to nest in Ohio. According to the Ohio Ornithological Society, the Rufa red knot is considered a "rare migrant, most likely along Lake Erie that prefers mudflats and beaches." This species is typically observed annually within Ohio, but with only a few sighting records per year on average. The USFWS's notification of listing for this species indicated that no designated critical habitat has yet been proposed for this species (within Ohio or elsewhere). The project study area is not located along the shore of Lake Erie. No mud flats or beaches were identified within the study area. Impacts to potential habitat are not expected.

The project area is located within the known ranges of the following State listed species:

Bigmouth shiner (*Notropis dorsalis*)
Low serviceberry (*Amelanchier humilis*)
Spotted turtle (*Clemmys guttata*)
Blanding's turtle (*Emydoidea blandingii*)
King rail (*Rallus elegans*)
Upland sandpiper (*Bartramia longicauda*)
Little brown bat (*Myotis lucifugus*)



Environmental Document Level: D1

PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge

Approved: 9/15/2023

Tricolored bat (*Perimyotis subflavus*)

There is no suitable habitat within the construction limits of the project area for the Upland sandpiper (*Bartramia longicauda*) or the King rail (*Rallus elegans*) species.

Little brown bat (*Myotis lucifugus*) and Tricolored bat (*Perimyotis subflavus*) - There are 2.3690 acres of suitable wooded habitat (SWH) located within the project area, 2.2596 acres of which is located within 100 feet from the edge of pavement, 0.0865 acre of which is located outside of 100 feet from pavement and more than 50 feet away from a stream, and 0.0229 acre of which is located outside of 100 feet from pavement and within 50 feet of a stream. Construction limits were not available at the time of the ESR submission. Using the study area limits as a worst-case scenario for the calculation of impacts, 2.2596 acres of suitable wooded habitat could be impacted. However, the trees will only be removed between October 1 and March 31, so will not impact these species

Bigmouth shiner (*Notropis dorsalis*) - The Ohio Natural Heritage Database has a record of the bigmouth shiner within the Rocky River upstream of the project site. As the Rocky River is located within the project site and is likely to be impacted by the project activities, impacts to bigmouth shiner habitat is likely. However, the bigmouth shiner is a highly mobile species and individuals would be very unlikely to remain in the study area after construction activity commenced.

Low serviceberry (*Amelanchier humilis*) - There are woodlots within the study area, so potential habitat for the low serviceberry is present. However, no low serviceberries were observed during the survey activities.

Spotted turtle (*Clemmys guttata*) - There are three wetlands bordering the Rocky River present within the study area. Wetlands A and B are broken up into mosaics by walking paths. Wetland C is very small and consists mainly of *Phalaris arundinacea*, an invasive species. Although spotted turtles' habitat includes wetlands, the wetlands within the study would not provide suitable habitat for this species.

Blanding's turtle (*Emydoidea blandingii*) - There are three wetlands bordering the Rocky River present within the study area. Wetlands A and B are broken up into mosaics by walking paths. Wetland C is very small and consists mainly of *Phalaris arundinacea*, an invasive species. Although Blanding's turtles' habitat includes wetlands, the wetlands within the study would not provide suitable habitat for this species.

No nesting birds or peregrine falcons were observed within the study area, or on the Hilliard Road Bridge, during the July 29, 2020 field survey. However, peregrine falcons and nests have been observed at other times and will be assumed to be a possibility as part of the planning for this project.

Agency Coordination

	Coordination Required:	Comments Received Date:
Ohio Department of Natural Resources (ODNR):	Yes	11/05/2020
United States Fish and Wildlife Service (USFWS):	Yes	10/30/2020
Ohio Environmental Protection Agency (OEPA):	No	
United States Army Corps of Engineers (USACE):	No	
ODNR State Scenic River:	No	
National Park Service (NPS) National Scenic River:	No	

Remarks:



Environmental Document Level: D1
PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge

Approved: 9/15/2023

The project was coordinated with USFWS and ODNR on September 30, 2020 and comments were received from USFWS on October 30, 2020 and ODNR on November 5, 2020.

The USFWS concurred the project May Affect, Not Likely to Adversely Affect the Indiana bat and Northern long-eared bat. This will require suitable wooded habitat be removed between October 1 and March 31. Furthermore, the project meets the criteria as CC1-b consultation category for bats in the PBO. Tree clearing will take place only from October 1 through March 31. For other known species, ODOT concluded the project would have No Effect due to the lack of suitable habitat for these species within the project area. Per ODNR comments, a mussel reconnaissance survey should be conducted and if necessary, a mussel survey and relocation prior to any in-stream work. The project is not likely to impact the state-listed species.

Are there any environmental commitments? Yes



Other Resources

Farmlands

The proposed project is located within an Urbanized Area Yes

The proposed project is located in an area that is in or committed to urban development or water storage and is therefore not subject to the Farmland Policy Protection Act (FPPA) in accordance with 7 CFR 658. No further coordination is required.

FCIR Required Completion of the Farmland Conversion Impact Form is required and coordination with USDA & NRCS is required.

Remarks:

Based upon review of appropriate mapping, the proposed project is located in an urbanized area zoned for non-agricultural purposes and is not in an agricultural district. Therefore, the proposed project meets the terms and conditions of the *Memorandum of Understanding between the Natural Resource Conservation Service and the Ohio Department of Transportation for Projects Involving Farmlands (Agreement No. 19552)*, executed on March 15, 2016. No further coordination is required.

Are there any environmental commitments? No

Drinking Water

The proposed project is wholly or partially located within the USEPA designated boundaries of a Sole Source Aquifer No

	Present:	Impacted:
The proposed project is wholly or partially located within the OEPA designated boundaries of a Source Water Protection Area	No	

Coordination with the Local Public Water Administrator is required No

	Present:	Impacted:
Residential Wells are present	No	

Remarks:

The Ohio EPA Division of Drinking and Ground Waters mapping tool was used to identify the presence of drinking water resources within the project study area. The map indicates that there are no public water system wells, intakes, drinking water source protection areas, non-transient, non-community Water Systems or transient non-community water systems within 1/2 mile of the project area. The project area does not lie over a Federally-designated sole source aquifer. Well locations near the project limits were mapped from ODNR Ground Water Mapping and Technical Services' website. No wells are located in the project area. No drinking water well impacts are anticipated. OEPA and ODNR mapping may be found in the Project File under Other Resources/Drinking Water



Environmental Document Level: D1
PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge
Approved: 9/15/2023

Are there any environmental commitments? No



Section 4(f)

Section 4(f) Determination

Section 4(f) properties are within and/or adjacent to the proposed project area Yes

Concurrence received from the OWJ Yes

Were there multiple OWJs? No

Date concurrence received:

	Present:	Impacted:
Publicly owned Park(s):	Yes	Yes
Publicly owned recreation facility(ies) and/or area(s):	Yes	Yes
Wildlife and Waterfowl refuge(s):	No	
Historic Site(s):	Yes	Yes

Identified Section 4(f) Properties

Identified 4(f) Properties

Property Name	Type	Permanent ROW/Easement Acres	Temporary ROW/Easement Acres	4(f) finding	Date
Rocky River Reservation	Publicly owned Park	1.83	1.73	De Minimis	04/04/2022
Valley Parkway Trail	Publicly owned Recreational Facility and/or Area	0.00	0.3	De Minimis	04/04/2022
Hilliard Road Bridge	Historic Site	0	0	Historic Bridge	04/25/2023

Remarks:

Rocky River Reservation

The Hilliard Road Bridge project will impact the park as follows:

1. Temporary right-of-way (less than 6 months) of 0.30 acres north of the bridge. This location is impacted during construction for the purpose of restoring the Valley Parkway Trail to its original location along the river.
2. Temporary right-of-way (more than 6 months) of 1.73 acres south of the bridge. This area is needed for construction access. Of this acreage, 0.53 acres are within the Rocky River.
3. Permanent right-of-way of 1.83 acres underneath the Hilliard Road Bridge. Of this acreage, 0.43 acres are within the Rocky River. Based upon right-of-way research, the existing bridge was constructed at this location with permission from the park rather than transfer of property rights. The initial grant was subject to the condition that the bridge be architecturally and structurally appropriate for the park surroundings. This project will include acquisition of the roadway right-of-way that is required for construction and future maintenance of the new bridge.



Environmental Document Level: D1
PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge

Approved: 9/15/2023

4. Temporary Access Fill (TAF) and/or a temporary structure on the Rocky River. A causeway, temporary bridge, or combination of both will be needed to provide access for construction activities. The TAF area is expected to be approximately 0.96 acres within the Rocky River. (Included within the acreages for #2 and #3 above.) The linear impact to the Rocky River is expected to be approximately 222 feet. This will impact river access for park users in this area.

Total Section 4(f) impact is 2.03 acres of temporary right-of-way and 1.83 acres of permanent right-of-way.

Access to the park (outside the construction limits) will be maintained during construction.

Valley Parkway Trail

The trail will be impacted only to restore it to its original location along the Rocky River. Access to the Valley Parkway Trail will be maintained during construction. There will be a short-term closure (most likely a few days at a time) during demolition and construction of bridge components above the trail. At this stage of preliminary design, it is not possible to estimate the number or durations of such closures.

4(f) Specific Public Involvement Summary

A Virtual Open House was conducted for the Hilliard Road Bridge project via the PublicInput.com website. Public notices were issued via letter dated February 1, 2021, news release, and posting on the County's website. Letters were mailed to 129 addresses. A news article appeared February 10, 2021, on WestLifeNews.com and on February 12, 2021 on Cleveland.com. The public input site included project information and a recorded presentation. The public involvement materials disclosed the anticipated park impacts. Comments were requested by March 1, 2021.

The public input website received 1,370 views from February 1st through March 1st. Two individuals requested hard copies of the materials. The majority of views occurred February 10th through February 18th, peaking at 237 viewers on February 13th.

As of March 1st, comments were received from 56 individuals and organizations. Comments have been analyzed so that they may be considered during future decision-making for the project.

Common topics included: Bridge type and/or aesthetics; Bicyclists and pedestrians, trails; Views/overlooks; Peregrine Falcons; River impacts; Maintenance of Traffic/duration of closure; Cost; Local concerns in the Hilliard Road corridor (such as development, rezoning)

No substantial comments were received regarding the park impacts, other than those related to the appearance of the historic bridge and the effect on the views to and from the park. Additional alternatives for the historic bridge are currently in development for discussion with the Consulting Parties as part of the Section 106 review process. Once additional information is available, a second virtual open house is expected regarding bridge aesthetics and other details.

Cleveland Metroparks has been included as part of the steering committee for the project, along with CCDPW, City of Lakewood, City of Rocky River, and ODOT.

The following measures to minimize harm will be incorporated into the plans as plan notes (as applicable) and as environmental commitments in the environmental document:

- The Valley Parkway Trail shall be restored to its original location along the Rocky River as part of the project.
- Areas of temporary occupancy shall be restored following construction. Revegetation plans for these areas will be coordinated with Cleveland Metroparks during Stage 3 design.
- Access to the remaining areas of the Rocky River Reservation shall be maintained at all times during construction activities.
- Access to Valley Parkway Trail and Valley Parkway will be maintained throughout construction, other than short-term closures to allow for work above the roadway and trail.
- Temporary construction fencing shall be installed along proposed construction limits prior to the start of construction activities to protect the existing Section 4(f) property and the public.
- Appropriate signage shall be installed to alert users of the park and trail of construction activities, access restrictions or closures, and to direct users to secondary access points.
- The contractor shall be required to closely coordinate the construction schedule with ODOT, CCDPW, and Cleveland Metroparks prior to the start of construction activities.

In accordance with 23 CFR 774, the proposed project will have a de minimis impact upon the Rocky River Reservation and Valley Parkway Trail based upon the following assessment:

- All possible planning to minimize harm has been incorporated into project development.
- The nature and magnitude of changes will not adversely affect the recreational activities, features, or attributes that qualified the property for Section 4(f) protection.
- Proposed measures to minimize harm and resulting mitigation, in regard to protecting the Section 4(f) property and maintaining access and safety, are considered to be reasonable and acceptable.

Based on the scope of the proposed project and type of work, there will be no adverse effects to the protected recreational activities, features, or attributes associated with the Rocky River Reservation and Valley Parkway Trail.

Are there any environmental commitments? Yes



Section 6(f)

Section 6(f) Determination

Section 6(f) Determination

	Present:	Impacted:
6(f) Properties:	Yes	Yes

Identified 6(f) Properties

Property Name	Permanent ROW/Easement Acres	Temporary ROW/Easement Acres	6(f) finding	Date
Rocky River Reservation	1.83	1.73	Conversion	06/07/2022
Valley Parkway Trail	0.00	0.30	Temporary Non-Conforming Use	06/07/2022

Remarks:

Rocky River Reservation

The Hilliard Road Bridge spans the Rocky River Reservation ('the park'), a long and narrow 1,000+ acre park that follows the Rocky River from Berea to just south of Lake Erie. The natural features include massive shale cliffs, deep floodplain forests, meadows, and wetlands. The park includes a nature center, marina, stables, picnic shelters, three golf courses, several multi-use trails, and a 14 mile bridle trail. Activities include hiking, biking, horseback riding, sledding, fishing & ice fishing, boating, and sailing. The first 3.8 acre parcel was purchased in 1919. The park is owned and maintained by the Cleveland Metroparks. (See park map in Appendix A of the Determination Request Form for Recreational Properties located in the Project File/Section 4(f)/Reports/Determination Request Form for Recreational Properties.pdf).

This publicly owned park was improved with Land and Water Conservation Funds (LWCF) and is subject to Section 4(f) and Section 6(f). Portions of the All Purpose Trail were developed using National Park Service (NPS) LWCF Grant #39-0944. (See LWCF mapping in Appendix E of the Determination Request Form for Recreational Properties located in the Project File/Section 4(f)/Reports/Determination Request Form for Recreational Properties.pdf). At the project location, the park contains the Rocky River, Valley Parkway Trail and Valley Parkway. Valley Parkway is a two-lane roadway providing vehicular access in the park. Parking is available adjacent to Valley Parkway underneath the I-90 bridge just north of the Hilliard Road Bridge. The zip code at the bridge is 44107.

The Hilliard Road Bridge project will impact the park as follows:

1. Temporary right-of-way (less than 6 months) of 0.30 acres north of the bridge. This location is impacted during construction for the purpose of restoring the Valley Parkway Trail to its original location along the river.
2. Temporary right-of-way (more than 6 months) of 1.73 acres south of the bridge. This area is needed for construction access. Of this acreage, 0.53 acres are within the Rocky River.



Environmental Document Level: D1

PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge

Approved: 9/15/2023

3. Permanent right-of-way of 1.83 acres underneath the Hilliard Road Bridge. Of this acreage, 0.43 acres are within the Rocky River. Based upon right-of-way research, the existing bridge was constructed at this location with permission from the park rather than transfer of property rights. The initial grant was subject to the condition that the bridge be architecturally and structurally appropriate for the park surroundings. This project will include acquisition of the roadway right-of-way that is required for construction and future maintenance of the new bridge.

4. Temporary Access Fill (TAF) and/or a temporary structure on the Rocky River. A causeway, temporary bridge, or combination of both will be needed to provide access for construction activities. The TAF area is expected to be approximately 0.96 acres within the Rocky River. (Included within the acreages for #2 and #3 above.) The linear impact to the Rocky River is expected to be approximately 222 feet. This will impact river access for park users in this area.

The total impact for the Section 6(f) Conversion consists of two components: the temporary impacts of greater than six months for construction access and the permanent right-of-way under the existing bridge. The total acreage of Conversion is 3.56 acres. The Yellow Book appraisal for this property is \$90,000. The recreational use and value of the existing impacted property is open and natural area for passive recreation adjacent to the Rocky River or fishing access. The Valley Parkway Trail crosses the area. Per National Park Service's letter dated June 7, 2022, NPS has approved Amendment No. 2 to Land and Water Conservation Fund (LWCF) project 39-00944, Rocky River Reservation. This amendment deletes 3.56 acres at Rocky River Reservation and adds 44.7414 acres as replacement land. The replacement property, located in City of Garfield Heights, is to be owned and operated by Cleveland Metroparks as a new, stand-alone park facility. The NPS approval letter has been uploaded to the Project File tab, under Section 6(f)/Coordination. The temporary impact (less than six months) of 0.30 acres north of the bridge for restoration of the trail location is assumed to be a temporary non-conforming use under Section 6(f) and is not included in the acreage for the Conversion.

Total Section 4(f) impact is 2.03 acres of temporary right-of-way and 1.83 acres of permanent right-of-way. Access to the park (outside the construction limits) will be maintained during construction.

Valley Parkway Trail

The trail will be impacted only to restore it to its original location along the Rocky River. Access to the Valley Parkway Trail will be maintained during construction. There will be a short-term closure (most likely a few days at a time) during demolition and construction of bridge components above the trail. At this stage of preliminary design, it is not possible to estimate the number or durations of such closures.

Are there any environmental commitments? Yes



Community Impacts

Community Impacts

Will the proposed action comply with the local/regional development patterns for the area? Yes

Remarks:

Yes, the proposed project is consistent with development plans and will not change the local/ regional development patterns. The project is mentioned in the City of Rocky River Master Plan as a regional infrastructure improvement that also "provides a branding opportunity for Rocky River and Lakewood". The alternative modes of transportation that will be able to traverse the new bridge will also provide much desired multi-use connections that were described by the public in the plan. Lakewood's Community Vision Our City's Master Plan identifies Mobility & Connectivity as one of the main focus areas. The plan states the goal to "Provide safe, convenient, and integrated transportation options throughout the community". The bridge and bridge lane configurations were completed with stakeholder input from both the City of Rocky River, the City of Lakewood, and many other transportation officials that are familiar with pedestrian and bike path best practices.

Will the proposed action result in substantial negative impacts to community cohesion? No

Remarks:

The proposed project is not anticipated to result in substantial negative impacts to community cohesion. The installation of sidewalks, a shared use path, and other roadway improvements will improve community cohesion by improving connections within the project area and to surrounding communities.

Will the proposed action result in indirect or cumulative impacts? No

Remarks:

The proposed project will not have indirect or cumulative impacts to the community. The project will improve safety.

Will the proposed action result in substantial impacts on health and educational facilities, public utilities, fire, police, emergency services, religious institutions, public transportation, pedestrian and bicycle facilities? No

Remarks:

Substantial impacts will not occur to health and educational facilities, public utilities, fire, police, emergency services, religious institutions, or public transportation facilities. Inconveniences will be experienced by public services (fire, police, and emergency services) as a result of the planned detour during the duration of construction; but the inconvenience will be temporary. Emergency services and schools will be notified of any delays and closures associated with construction. The project will improve pedestrian and bicycle facilities.

Will the proposed action displace residents, businesses, institutions or farms? No

Remarks:

No residents, businesses, institutions or farms will be displaced as a result of this project.

Will the proposed project result in impacts to Underrepresented Populations (Limited English Proficiency, Older Adults, or Adults with Disabilities) raised during Public Involvement? No

Remarks:



Environmental Document Level: D1
PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge
Approved: 9/15/2023

The proposed project will not result in impacts to Underrepresented Populations (Limited English Proficiency, Older Adults, or Adults with Disabilities).

Are there any Environmental Commitments? No



Environmental Justice

Environmental Justice

Identified Environmental Justice Populations

Census Block Group #	% Minority	% Low Income
390351812042	9	8
390351812031	1	11
390351609002	11	42
390351609003	15	13

Are Environmental Justice Populations located within and/or adjacent to the proposed project area? Yes

Are there any relocations? No

Will there be changes to access? No

Will the proposed project result in unanticipated additional impacts to any Environmental Justice Populations? No

Were any concerns related to impacts on Environmental Justice Populations or any other unique factors that could result in a disproportionately high and adverse effect raised during public involvement? No

Remarks:

Lawhon & Associates, Inc. reviewed ODOT's TIMS to determine the presence of Environmental Justice Populations in the project area. According to TIMS, the minority population in the project area ranges from 1 to 15% and the low-income population ranges from 8 to 42%.

The proposed project will have no disproportionately high and adverse effects to minority or low-income populations or disparate impacts to a Title VI population based upon the table above, the attached mapping, and the answers to the questions above. No concerns related to impacts on Environmental Justice or Title VI populations were raised as a result of public involvement activities conducted as part of the proposed project. Therefore, in accordance with the protections of Executive Order 12898, FHWA Order 6640.23A and Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, no further analysis is required.

Special efforts were made to engage Environmental Justice Populations within the project area during public involvement. The project team followed ODOT's guidance on Environmental Justice Populations to prepare documentation required to address Title VI of the Civil Rights Act, the Executive Order on Environmental Justice, and similar regulations. Notifications and materials for the public meetings had large font and easily understood graphics and language. Online information was also available in printed copies if requested. Based on the above findings an EJAR is not required.

Census Mapping can be found in the Project File under Environmental Justice/Project Information/Census Mapping.

Are there any Environmental Commitments? No



Public Involvement

Public Involvement

Please provide a summary of the Public Involvement activities that have been conducted for this project. (For example press releases, letters to affected property owners and residents, meetings, special purpose meetings, newspaper articles, etc)

The following public involvement activities have taken place:

- May 2018 Steering Committee Meeting #1
- January 2019 Stakeholder Meeting #1
- April 2019 Steering Committee Meeting #2
- June August 2019 Special Purpose Meetings with Community Leaders
- November 2020 Steering Committee Meeting #3
- December 2020 Stakeholder Meeting #2
- February/March 2021 Public Meeting #1
- April 2021 Steering Committee Meeting #4
- December/January 2022 Public Meeting #2

Letters were sent to the adjacent property owners on May 14, 2018 to notify them of the project and provide notice of work crews potentially entering their property to collect field data.

Steering committee members were invited to meetings via email. Stakeholders were notified via mailed letters. Members of the public were also notified of public meetings (open houses) via mailed letters and press releases sent one month prior to the start of the open house.

The first two Steering Committee meetings were held on May 2, 2018 and April 11, 2019, respectively. The first meeting introduced the project and project need, discussed the projects history and previous studies, obtain feedback and concerns, and discuss next steps. The second meeting updated the Steering Committee on work performed to date and the findings of the design team (the existing bridge should not be rehabilitated, and a new bridge should be constructed). The committee and project team discussed potential concerns of this decision. This meeting also discussed the project schedule and components, funding, design considerations, environmental updates, and questions.

The first stakeholder meeting was held on January 8, 2019 at the office of the Cuyahoga County Department of Public Works, 2079 East Ninth Street, Cleveland, Ohio. Meeting attendees included representatives from various organizations with an interest in the Hilliard Road Bridge. The purpose of the meeting was to introduce the project; summarize the project history and studies completed to date; obtain stakeholder feedback; and discuss concerns. A presentation was used to guide the discussion.

In preparation for the upcoming public meetings, the public involvement strategy was split into two rounds: round 1 focusing on selecting a bridge type, and round 2 focusing on comments on the bridge type

Round 1

The third steering committee meeting was held virtually on November 19, 2020. The purpose of this meeting was to share the results of the feasibility study and get feedback on how to present the findings to the public, share and receive feedback on preferred bridge lane configuration, share and receive feedback on the results of the structure type study, explain how the project team will address bridge aesthetics, and review next steps.

A second stakeholder meeting was held virtually on December 16, 2020 with much of the same information being presented as third steering committee meeting. The purpose of this stakeholder meeting was to share the results of the feasibility study, share and receive comments on preferred bridge lane configuration, share and receive comments on the bridge type options, explain how the project team will address bridge aesthetics, and review next steps.

The first virtual public meeting was held in an open-house style from February 1, 2021 to March 1, 2021 to present the findings of the feasibility study, share and receive comments on potential new bridge types, request Section 106 consulting parties, and explain how the project team will address aesthetics. The meeting was facilitated through the PublicInput.com project webpage. The virtual meeting was available for participants to join online, review project information, and comment, at their leisure, for at least 30 days. Project and meeting information was sent to those in the project study area by mail as well as advertised with fliers sent to nearby apartment complexes, businesses, and other community centers. Additional notifications were sent through e-mail and on the



Environmental Document Level: D1

PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge

Approved: 9/15/2023

CCDPW/ODOT/City website(s).

Round 2

A fourth steering committee meeting was held April 30, 2021. The purpose of this meeting was to discuss the feedback received from the public meeting, discuss and gather feedback on the selected bridge type, discuss and receive feedback on aesthetic options, inform attendees about the results of the environmental studies, and discuss next steps.

A second public meeting was held in an open-house style format from December 15, 2021 to January 15, 2022 to present the selected bridge type, explain and receive comments on aesthetic options, inform about the results of the environmental studies, and discuss next steps. The meeting was facilitated through the PublicInput.com project webpage. Project and meeting information was sent via mail to those in the project study area as well as those who participated in the first public meeting open house. Additional notifications were posted on the CCDPW/ODOT/City website(s) and sent to local news outlets.

Consulting Parties Meetings

Consulting Parties meetings were held as part of the Section 106 Consultation Process on 7/29/21, 11/19/21, 3/30/22, and 12/12/22. These meetings were held to inform the consulting parties about the purpose of the project, the alternatives under consideration, the comparison of alternatives, effects on the historic bridge, and to discuss proposed mitigation measures and comment on the draft Memorandum of Agreement.

Is there any substantial environmental controversy on environmental grounds?

No

Please summarize the Public Involvement responses received.

The first public meeting sought feedback on the replacement of the bridge and potential bridge type to be built. The public input website received 1,370 views. Two individuals requested hard copies of the materials. Comments were received from 56 individuals and organizations. Comment topics included:

- Bridge type and/or aesthetics
- Bicyclists and pedestrians, trails
- Views/overlooks
- Peregrine Falcons
- River impacts
- Maintenance of Traffic/duration of closure
- Cost
- Local concerns in the Hilliard Road corridor (such as development, rezoning, vacant lots)

A majority of the comments supported the replacement of the bridge, but hoped that the bridge type selected would achieve a historic appearance and most preferred the arch type bridge structure.

A summary of comments received and response to comment was posted to the public input website.

The second public meeting open house announced the selection of the replacement bridge type (steel arch bridge). During the second public meeting open house, the public input website received 1,067 views. Comments were received from 44 individuals and organizations. Comment topics included:

- Support of the arch bridge type selected
- Lane reduction
- Roundabout
- Concern about preventing jumping/falls

Almost all comments supported the selection of the arch bridge type, however many were concerned with the lane reduction and roundabout needed to make the bridge type feasible. There was also a number of comments that supported the installation of a vandal protection/safety fence.

A summary of comments received and response to comment was posted to the public input website.

Are there any Environmental Commitments? Yes



Permits

Waterway Permits

Are Waterway Permits required?	Yes
Is the Waterway Permits Determination Complete?	No
Army Corps of Engineers	
Regional General Permit (RGP):	No
Nationwide Permit (NWP):	Yes
Section 404 Individual Permit:	No
Section 10 Permit:	No
Ohio EPA	
Section 401 Water Quality Certification:	No
Level 1 General Isolated Wetland Permit:	No
Level 2 Individual Isolated Wetland Permit:	No
Level 3 individual Isolated Wetland Permit:	No
US Coast Guard	
Section 9 Coordination:	No
Section 9 Bridge Permit:	No
ODNR	
Shore Structure Permit :	No

Remarks:

Permits will be required. A commitment is included for CCDPW to obtain required waterway permits prior to construction activities. The project is expected to qualify for Section 404 Nationwide Permit 3 with a Pre-Construction Notification based upon a bridge replacement with 306LF of impact to Rocky River, 0.96 acres for temporary access fill (TAF), and approximately 0.157 acres of wetland impacts. Impacts will be confirmed based upon Stage 2 design and the required permits will be verified.

Are there any environmental commitments? Yes

Storm Water Permits

NPDES Construction General Permit for Stormwater (NOI):	Yes
Watershed Specific NPDES Construction General Permit for Stormwater (NOI):	No



Environmental Document Level: D1

PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge

Approved: 9/15/2023

Remarks:

The type of NPDES permitting that is required will be determined during detailed design.

Are there any environmental commitments? Yes

Floodplains

The proposed project involves encroachment within a Special Flood Hazard Area (SFHA) Yes

EO 11988/NFIP Coordination and Documentation Completed Yes

NFIP Local Floodplain Coordinator Notification Date 04/22/2021

Remarks:

The proposed replacement bridge results in a reduction of physical structure located within the floodplain. During construction it is anticipated that a temporary causeway/temporary structure will be required to allow the contractor to cross the river to access the proposed skewback foundation and valley slope on the east side of the river. The local floodplain administrator was contacted via email 4/22/2021 and provided a copy of the hydraulic analysis report. Further coordination will be completed during detail design.
A

Are there any environmental commitments? Yes

Landfills

Is a 2713 Permit required? No

Remarks:

No landfills were identified within the project study area.

Are there any environmental commitments? No



Environmental Commitments

ESA

1) The designer will include a Plan Note for the Contractor's completion of the OEPA Notification of Demolition and Renovation for No Asbestos Above Regulatory Limits.

ASBESTOS NOTIFICATION

A CERTIFIED ASBESTOS HAZARD EVALUATION SPECIALIST SURVEYED THE BRIDGE STRUCTURE SCHEDULED FOR DEMOLITION AND/OR REHABILITATION; THE SURVEY DETERMINED THAT NO ASBESTOS IS PRESENT ON THE BRIDGE STRUCTURE.

ODOT SHALL PROVIDE A COPY OF THE OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY (OEPA) NOTIFICATION OF DEMOLITION AND RENOVATION FORM, PARTIALLY COMPLETED AND SIGNED BY THE BRIDGE OWNER, TO THE SUCCESSFUL BIDDER. THE CONTRACTOR SHALL COMPLETE THE FORM AND SUBMIT IT TO ONE OF THE ADDRESSES BELOW AT LEAST TEN (10) WORKING DAYS PRIOR TO THE START OF ANY DEMOLITION AND/OR RENOVATION.

ASBESTOS PROGRAM
OHIO EPA, DAPC
P.O. BOX 1049
COLUMBUS, OH 43216-1049
OR

ASBESTOS PROGRAM
OHIO EPA, DAPC
50 W. TOWN ST., SUITE 700
COLUMBUS, OH 43215

THE CONTRACTOR SHALL PROVIDE A COPY OF THE COMPLETED FORM TO THE ENGINEER AT LEAST TEN (10) WORKING DAYS PRIOR TO THE START OF ANY DEMOLITION AND/OR RENOVATION. THE FORM SHALL INCLUDE: 1) THE CONTRACTORS NAME AND ADDRESS, 2) THE SCHEDULED DATES FOR THE START AND COMPLETION OF THE BRIDGE REMOVAL AND 3) A DESCRIPTION OF THE PLANNED DEMOLITION WORK AND THE METHOD(S) TO BE USED. COPIES OF THE OEPA FORM AND BRIDGE INSPECTION REPORT ARE AVAILABLE FOR REVIEW AT THE ODOT DISTRICT 12 OFFICE, 5500 TRANSPORTATION BOULEVARD, GARFIELD HEIGHTS, OHIO 44125.

BASIS FOR PAYMENT THE CONTRACTOR SHALL FURNISH ALL FEES, LABOR, AND MATERIAL NECESSARY TO COMPLETE AND SUBMIT THE OEPA NOTIFICATION FORM. PAYMENT FOR THIS WORK SHALL BE INCLUDED IN ITEM 202: PORTIONS OF STRUCTURE REMOVED, AS PER PLAN.

Cultural Resources

1) Interpretive Plaque or Display - An interpretive plaque or display will be installed within the Cleveland Metroparks' Rocky River Reservation in the vicinity of the new bridge and adjacent to the Emerald Necklace Trail which runs generally parallel to Valley Parkway. Design, text, installation, and future maintenance will be the responsibility of Cleveland Metroparks. The County will contribute \$5,000 for the resource specific signage to cover the full cost of designing, constructing, and installing the signage; Cleveland Metroparks shall not be responsible for any costs associated with the signage. The SHPO and Consulting Parties will be provided 30 days to review and comment on the design and text prior to final design.



Environmental Document Level: D1

PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge

Approved: 9/15/2023

- 2) Aesthetic Treatments - The following aesthetic treatments will be incorporated into the design of the new bridge:
- (i.) The arch bridge design will include a multi-use path and buffer atop the bridge deck with at least one overlook on the bridge deck.
 - (ii.) The overlook design will take into consideration the views of the Consulting Parties, Cleveland Metroparks, and the public. The SHPO and Consulting Parties will be provided 30 days to review and comment on the overlook design prior to final design.
 - (iii.) Materiality and color of the chosen railing/parapet design will take into consideration the views of the Consulting Parties, Cleveland Metroparks, and the public while keeping safety a priority. The SHPO and the Consulting Parties will be provided 30 days to review and comment on the railing/parapet design prior to final design.
 - (iv.) Lighting design will take into consideration the views of the Consulting Parties, Cleveland Metroparks, and the public. The new bridge design will only provide lighting on the bridge deck. The SHPO, Cleveland Metroparks, and the Consulting Parties will be provided 30 days to review and comment on the lighting design prior to final design.
- 3) Recordation - Prior to demolition, a permanent record of the Bridge will be prepared to Historic American Engineering Record (HAER) Level 2 National Park Service (NPS) standards. Refer to executed MOA for detailed requirements and cost limitations.

Ecological

- 1) Ensure impacts to the federally listed and protected Indiana bat and northern long-eared bat are avoided and minimized. Do not remove trees from April 1 through September 30. Perform all necessary tree removal from October 1 through March 31. Demarcate clearing limits in the field to avoid any unauthorized tree clearing. For the purposes of this note, a tree is defined as a live, dying, or dead woody plant, with a trunk three inches or greater in diameter at a height of 4.5 feet above the ground surface, and with a minimum height of 13 feet.
- 2) The Cuyahoga County Department of Public Works will hire a State permitted malacologist to complete a mussel salvage and relocation in accordance with the most recent version of the Ohio Mussel Survey Protocol prior to the initiation of construction activities below the ordinary high water mark of Rocky River. The mussel survey must occur after May 1 and before October 1 either within the same season as the instream work or the season prior to the instream work. Submit the results of the mussel survey, salvage work, or both to the ODOT District 12 Environmental Coordinator, Mark Carpenter, P.E. (216) 584-2089. Obtain approval from the Department prior to performing work below ordinary high water mark Rocky River.
- 3) In-Water Work Restrictions - Do not work below the Ordinary High Water Mark of the Rocky River, or install, modify, or remove any existing instream fills during the ODNR instream work restriction period of September 15th through June 30th.
- 4) Coastal Zone Consistency Statement: Cuyahoga County will obtain a Coastal Zone Consistency statement from the Ohio Department of Natural Resources prior to plan file.
- 5) Migratory Bird Protection: The project will avoid the take of a Peregrine falcon.
- 6) Migratory Bird Protection: Construction activities shall not pursue, hunt, shoot, wound, kill, capture, or collect a Peregrine falcon.
- 7) Migratory Bird Protection: Temporary nest boxes shall be provided on adjacent bridge structures. Close off the area around a particular nesting box where work is planned during a breeding season.
- 8) Migratory Bird Protection: Plan note shall be included to direct the Contractor how to avoid, minimize and mitigate potential impacts to peregrine falcon. Confirm wording of plan note with ODOT District 12 Environmental Coordinator.

Section 4(f)



Environmental Document Level: D1

PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge

Approved: 9/15/2023

- 1) The Valley Parkway Trail shall be restored to its original location along the Rocky River as part of the project.
- 2) Areas of temporary occupancy shall be restored following construction. Revegetation plans for these areas will be coordinated with Cleveland Metroparks during Stage 3 design.
- 3) Access to the remaining areas of the Rocky River Reservation shall be maintained at all times during construction activities.
- 4) Access to Valley Parkway Trail and Valley Parkway will be maintained throughout construction, other than short-term closures to allow for work above the roadway and trail.
- 5) Temporary construction fencing shall be installed along proposed construction limits prior to the start of construction activities to protect the existing Section 4(f) property and the public.
- 6) Appropriate signage shall be installed to alert users of the park and trail of construction activities, access restrictions or closures, and to direct users to secondary access points.
- 7) The contractor shall closely coordinate the construction schedule (including access restrictions) with ODOT, ODNR, CCDPW, and Cleveland Metroparks prior to the start of construction activities.
- 8) Recreational Boating: The Contractor shall place appropriate signage/buoys/markers at least 300 feet upstream and at least 300 feet downstream of the project area to alert paddlers/boaters of construction activity and for wayfinding purposes.
- 9) Recreational Boating: The Project Engineer or Contractor shall notify ODNR Parks and Watercraft (Natalie.Foos@dnr.ohio.gov) 14 calendar days prior to the start of construction activities to allow ODNR to post notice of the impending project construction on the appropriate ODNR webpages and associated online boating maps. As part of notification efforts, the Project Engineer shall also provide plans that indicate signage location along the waterway and any additional planned notification efforts with ODNR that will take place during or after construction.
- 10) Recreational Fishing Access: There will be no permanent change to fishing access. During construction, the area with the construction zone will not be accessible. Visitors may access areas outside the construction zone. CCDPW will work with Metroparks on appropriate signage.
- 11) Recreational Boating Portage: There will be no permanent change to canoe or kayak passage. During construction, vessels will not be permitted within the construction zone. CCDPW will work with Metroparks during design to identify a portage area and appropriate signing.
- 12) Recreational Boating: The Project Engineer or Contractor shall notify ODNR Parks and Watercraft (Natalie.Foos@dnr.ohio.gov) 48 hours in advance when restrictions lasting longer than a day will occur.
- 13) Recreational Boating: Recreational boating access within the project area shall be maintained at all times during construction activities, except for the time needed for temporary access restrictions associated with demolition and construction activities.
- 14) Recreational Boating: If on-the-water law enforcement is needed during any portion of the construction activities, the Project Engineer or Contractor shall contact the ODNR Division of Parks and Watercraft Law Enforcement Supervisor, Lt. Walt Hodgkiss at 419-349-2295.

Section 6(f)

- 1) The City of Garfield Heights will transfer the approved 44.7414 acre 6(f) replacement property to the Cleveland Metroparks to own and operate as a new standalone park facility.

Public Involvement

- 1) The bridge will include vandal protection fencing.



Environmental Document Level: D1

PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge

Approved: 9/15/2023

Permits - Waterway Permits

1) Waterway Permits: CCDPW will obtain all appropriate waterway permits prior to any work within the jurisdictional boundary of any waterway, including wetlands, and all applicable waterway permits will be noted under Special Provisions and/or included in the plans and adhered to during construction.

Permits - Storm Water Permits

1) CCDPW will obtain required NPDES permitting prior to plan file.

Permits - Floodplains

1) CCDPW will obtain the floodplain permit or documentation of exemption prior to plan file.



Environmental Document Level: D1

PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge

Approved: 9/15/2023

Preparers and Approvals

Form Preparer:

Susan Daniels
Lawhon & Associates, Inc.
1441 King Avenue, Columbus OH 43212
614-481-8600
sdaniels@lawhon-assoc.com

Supporting Form Preparer(s):

Mark Carpenter
Abigail Anacki
Andrew Fluegemann
Bob Mileti
Libby Rushley
Matthew Pastorelle
Nabil Farah

Approvals & Electronic Signatures

Approved & Electronically Signed By:	Approval Date:
Mark Carpenter (TRANS ENGR 3)	9/15/2023



Appendix

General

Aerial Map.pdf

County Map.pdf

Metropark ROW concept plan.pdf

Project Study Area Map.pdf

Schematic Plan-Updated.pdf

USGS Quadrangle Topographical Map.pdf

Utility Conflicts.pdf

Alternatives

Constructability Review Notes.pdf

Cost Comparison Report.pdf

OES Acceptance - Feasibility Study.pdf

ESA

6F Replacement Property-ORPS report.pdf

OES Recommendations - RMR Screening Approval.pdf

OES Recommendations - Screening 6f Property.pdf

Regulated Materials Review Form-Section6f-Property.pdf

Cultural Resources

6F Replacement Property-SHPO Map.pdf

ACHP Comments_Confirmation.pdf

ACHP Coordination_Executed MOA.pdf

ACHP Response.pdf

ACHP e106 Notification.pdf

Consulting Party Application_Bridge CPs.pdf.pdf

Consulting Party Comments_Blue.pdf

Consulting Party Contact List_Revised.xlsx

Consulting Party Coordination MOA.pdf

Consulting Party Meeting Minutes.pdf

Consulting Party Request Acknowledgement_Accordino.pdf



Environmental Document Level: D1

PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge

Approved: 9/15/2023

Consulting Party Request Acknowledgement_Blue.pdf
Consulting Party Request Acknowledgement_Buddner.pdf
Consulting Party Request Acknowledgement_Dieringer.pdf.pdf
Consulting Party Request Acknowledgement_Palumbo_Lake HS.pdf
Consulting Party Request Acknowledgement_Weinmann .pdf
Field Review Summary - History Architecture - Meeting Notes .pdf
Records Check.pdf
SHPO Comments
Section 106 Scoping Request Form-6F Replacement Property.pdf
Section 106 Scoping Request Form.pdf
Transmittal 1 - Effect Determination
Transmittal 2 - Archaeology Re-evaluation
Transmittal 3 - Effect Determination Re-evaluation
Tribal Consultation
Ecological
6F Replacement Property-Eco Walkover.pdf
Coordination with ODNR and USFWS.pdf
ODNR Comments.pdf
USFWS Comments Consult Form CUY-Hilliard Rd Br PID 109594.pdf
Other Resources
Water Source Protection Area Map.pdf
Well Log Data.pdf
Section 4(f)
OES Cultural Resources 4(f) Determination_IOC.pdf
OES Recreational 4(f) Determination.pdf
OWJ Concurrence.pdf
Section 6(f)
Appraisal Revised - 6f Conversion.pdf
Appraisal-6F Conversion.pdf
Appraisal-Replacement Property.pdf
LWCF Grant Listing.pdf
MOU Cover Page - Signed Contract Agreement.pdf



Environmental Document Level: D1

PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge

Approved: 9/15/2023

MOU between MetroParks and County.pdf

NPS Approval - Conversion.pdf

NPS Comments - Conditional Approval of Replacement property.pdf

Proof of Payment of Property in Garfield Hts 5-23-22.pdf

Replacement Property-Concept Plan.pdf

Replacement Property-USGS Map.pdf

Revised Appraisal - Section 6(f) Replacement Property.pdf

Environmental Justice

Census Mapping.pdf

Public Involvement

Property Owner Notification Letter - Mailing List.pdf

Property Owner Notification Letter.pdf

Public Comments Received - Public Meeting 1.pdf

Public Comments Received - Public Meeting 2.pdf

Public Involvement Plan.docx

Public Meeting 1 - CCDPW Web Posting.pdf

Public Meeting 1 - News Release.pdf

Public Meeting 1 - Notification Letter Mailing List.pdf

Public Meeting 1 - Notification Letter.pdf

Public Meeting 1 - Presentation and Transcript.pdf

Public Meeting 1 - Public Input Site Screenshot.pdf

Public Meeting 1 - Stakeholder Notification.pdf

Public Meeting 1 - Westlife News Article.pdf

Public Meeting 2 - Cleveland News Article.pdf

Public Meeting 2 - News Release Mailing List.pdf

Public Meeting 2 - News Release.pdf

Public Meeting 2 - Notification Letter Mailing List.pdf

Public Meeting 2 - Notification Letter.pdf

Public Meeting 2 - Public Input Site Printable.pdf

Public Meeting 2 - Public Input Site Screenshot.pdf

Response to Public Comments - Public Meeting 1.pdf

Stakeholder Contact List.pdf



Environmental Document Level: D1

PID 109594 CUY Hilliard Road Bridge

Approved: 9/15/2023

Stakeholder Meeting 1 - Meeting Minutes.pdf

Stakeholder Meeting 1 - Notification.pdf

Stakeholder Meeting 1 - Presentation.pdf

Stakeholder Meeting 2 - Attendees.pdf

Stakeholder Meeting 2 - Meeting Minutes.pdf

Stakeholder Meeting 2 - Presentation.pdf

Stakeholder Notification-Update 7-14-22.pdf

Steering Committee Contact List.pdf

Steering Committee Meeting 2 - Meeting Minutes.pdf

Steering Committee Meeting 2 - Presentation.pdf

Steering Committee Meeting 3 - Comments Received.pdf

Steering Committee Meeting 3 - Meeting Minutes.pdf

Steering Committee Meeting 3 - Presentation.pdf

Steering Committee Meeting 4 - Meeting Minutes.pdf

Steering Committee Meeting 4 - Presentation.pdf

Permits

Correspondence with Local Floodplain Administrator.pdf

FEMA FIRM.pdf